Review on Labor Market Information System (LMIS) in Lebanon
Review on Labor Market Information System (LMIS) in Lebanon

Oussama GHNEIM
Beirut - Lebanon
This study would not have been possible without the support of UNESCO. I am thankful to the UNESCO- Regional Office Staff in Beirut, especially Mr. Salim Shehadeh, Program Specialist for the Technical and Vocational Education and Training Unit at UNESCO, for his input and guidance throughout the study; as well as Mr. Liliane Eido for her assistance for the duration of the study.

This study is within the framework of UNESCO’s Youth Employment in the Meditation (YEM) Project supported by the European Union (EU). I am grateful to all those who contributed to the accomplishment of this study by sharing their insight and expertise with me.

I sincerely thank the BeLebanon team, especially Mrs. Noor Obeid and Mrs. Mireille Abdel Malak for their fieldwork, interviews, and for the reviewing and editing of this report. Also, a special thanks to the WARD team, especially Mr. Issam Abi Nader and Mr. Elie Kassis for their invaluable input.

Oussama GHNEIM
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgment .................................................................................................................. 4  
Table of Content .................................................................................................................. 5  
Acronyms .................................................................................................................................. 7  
Summary .................................................................................................................................... 8  
Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 9  

TVET Education in Lebanon .................................................................................................... 11  
  Administrative Structure of Vocational and Technical Education in Lebanon .................. 11  
  TVET Education Structure in Lebanon .................................................................................. 17  
  Background and Purpose of Report ....................................................................................... 18  

Desk Review ............................................................................................................................. 19  
  LMIS Definitions ..................................................................................................................... 19  
  LMIS Functions ...................................................................................................................... 19  
  LMIS Elements ....................................................................................................................... 20  
  Elements of LMIS and their Corresponding Requirements ................................................. 20  
  LMIS Actors in Lebanon According to the ILO ................................................................. 20  
  Labor Market Information Generation and Flow of Labor Market Information ............... 22  
  LMIS Effects on Unemployment ......................................................................................... 23  

LMIS in Lebanon: Overview .................................................................................................... 24  
  Labor Market Information Generation and Flow of Labor Market Information in Lebanon... 26  

The Lebanese National Employment Office (NEO) .................................................................. 27  
  Timeline of NEO Development ............................................................................................ 27  
  Current Status ..................................................................................................................... 27  
  System .................................................................................................................................... 27  
  Data Gathering .................................................................................................................... 28  
  Reaching Stakeholders ......................................................................................................... 28  

LMIS and National TVET Providers in Lebanon ...................................................................... 29  
  Current methodologies ......................................................................................................... 29  
  Obstacles in Current Methodologies .................................................................................. 30  
  Recommendations for Current Methodologies .................................................................. 30  
  TVET and LMIS: Data Sharing and Collaboration ............................................................. 30  
  Data Gathering .................................................................................................................... 30  
  Data Sharing ....................................................................................................................... 31  
  Recommendations on Setting Educational Strategies ...................................................... 31  

A Look at Other Employment Systems in Lebanon ................................................................. 33  
  UNRWA’s Placement and Career Guidance System (PCGS) ............................................. 33  
  Development of the Timeline .............................................................................................. 33  
  Current Status PCGS .......................................................................................................... 33  
  Evaluation ............................................................................................................................. 33  
  Gaps and Recommendations in the PCGS: ........................................................................ 34
Data Gathering ................................................................. 34
Reaching Stakeholders ..................................................... 34
Users: Unemployed, Students and Companies ....................... 34
TVET Institutes .................................................................. 34
Demand Side of the Market ............................................... 34
Growing Markets and New Jobs ......................................... 35
Skill Matching .................................................................. 35
Jobs, Industries Sectors Recommended .................................. 35
LABORA .......................................................................... 35
Development of Time-Line .................................................. 35
Current Status Labora ......................................................... 35
Evaluation ......................................................................... 36
Gaps and Recommendations for Labora ............................... 36
Data Gathering ................................................................. 36
Reaching Stakeholders ....................................................... 36
Users: Unemployed, Students and Companies ....................... 36
TVET Institutes .................................................................. 36
Demand Side of the Market ............................................... 36
Growing Markets and New Jobs ......................................... 36

Labor Market Studies in Lebanon ........................................ 37
Market Study Impacts and Methodologies ............................. 37
Some Identified Methodologies being used were ................... 37
Most Reliable Sources of Information ................................... 37
Data and Information Requested to be Available ................... 37
Interest in LMIS .................................................................. 37
The Criteria Recommended ................................................. 38
Gaps ............................................................................ 38
Recommendations ............................................................. 38

Lebanese National Employment Office: Gaps and Recommendations ........................................ 39
System Gaps and Recommendations ...................................... 39
Data Gaps and Recommendations ........................................ 40
National Gaps and Recommendations .................................... 40

Conclusion ........................................................................ 41
LMIS and TVET ................................................................. 41

One or multiple LMIS .......................................................... 43
Annex (1): List of persons, institutions interviewed .................. 43
Annex (2): Methodology ...................................................... 43
Annex (3): List of References ............................................... 44
### Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CGC</td>
<td>Career Guidance and Counselling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DACUM</td>
<td>Development of a Curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ETF</td>
<td>European Training Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HCC</td>
<td>High Curriculum Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRD</td>
<td>Human Resources Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>German International Cooperation/Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRC</td>
<td>The International Rescue Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LABORA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LM</td>
<td>Labour Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMIS</td>
<td>Labour Market Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMS</td>
<td>Labour Market Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEHE</td>
<td>Ministry of Education &amp; Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoF</td>
<td>Ministry of Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoL</td>
<td>Ministry of labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoSA</td>
<td>Ministry of Social Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>National Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEO</td>
<td>National Employment Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMSAR</td>
<td>Office of the Minister of State for Administrative Reform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRM</td>
<td>Storage Resource Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>Technical and Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCG</td>
<td>Placement and Career Guidance System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNRWA</td>
<td>United Nations Relief and Works Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTC</td>
<td>Vocational Training Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WBL</td>
<td>Work Based Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YEM</td>
<td>Youth Employment in the Mediterranean</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Summary

Globally, LMIS assists in job matching, job searching, and providing information about market needs, developing job profiles, and improving application skills. LMIS also give beneficial information to employers about the development of new sectors and professions. LMIS provides governments with data that help shape policies. LMIS connects with the TVET sector by playing a role in identifying new specializations and offering career guidance. In Lebanon, there were some attempts to strengthen the National Employment office to achieve a full-fledged LMIS. However, issues such as the country’s makeup, economic problems, and institutional governance were major roadblocks.

In Lebanon there is no LMIS, but rather a national employment office and independent employment programs within NGOs or the private sector. Lebanon also suffers from a lack of data both on a regional and national level, which are prerequisites for a functioning and effective LMIS. The Lebanese Technical and Vocational education sector, which may be an asset to the country’s economy in terms of rectifying the mismatch between demand and supply for the labor force, is also sidelined from having access to labor market data. Thus, unable to cope with the changing demands of the market in a timely and effective manner.

In this report, we look at alternative systems to a complete LMIS such as UNRWAs placements, career guidance system, and the LABORAs employment system. UNRWAs PCGS is effective within the Palestinian context and accessible to labor markets. Although there is, a lack of an online presence, there is a strong collaboration between departments and experienced councilors resulting in a high coverage of employment offices.

The report covers assessments on labor market studies’ methodologies, data collection, and interest in LMIS in Lebanon. The interviews identified barriers for data collection but producers expressed interest in gathering data from a national LMIS to overcome said barriers and set their recommendations for the LMIS criteria. The report assesses NEO’s efforts in addressing three main components: data collection and availability, technical systems, and corresponding gaps and recommendations.

Finally, the author draws some conclusions to set a work plan targeting these gaps within four focal points: data collection, technical system, communication between parties, and data analysis and feedback. Some of the important steps towards a functioning system is creating units or pockets of LMIS technicians internally with each office (ministry, organization or institution within the LMIS stakeholder) and four think tanks related to the outputs of the LMIS while supporting NEO on the technical front by referring to the ILO.

Referring to the importance of TVET education for the future of the Lebanese economy and targeting the mismatch between labor market supply and demand, the author also suggests a breakdown of the TVET think tank within the LMIS system.
Introduction

Lebanon is a small country with a population of approximately 4,800,000\(^1\) and hosts around 1.5 million Syrian refugees, 500,000 Palestinian refugees, and 50,000 Lebanese returnees from Syria.

Lebanon’s economic growth is hindered by political instability and low investment in productive activities due to oligopolies and widespread corruption. Lebanon is in a “slow growth trap” due to the low levels of private and public investment and insufficient business competition in the domestic market\(^2\). The country has been unable to absorb the surplus of its educated young labor force. In addition, the Syrian crisis has resulted in the influx of approximately 1.5 million Syrian refugees, disruption of trade routes, and a decrease in consumer goods from Syria. The regional political instability have increased the burden on an already strained Lebanese economy.

Lebanon highest unemployment rate is for youth between the ages of 15-24 at 34% and the highest level of unemployment is amongst university level graduates (8.8%)\(^3\).

Lebanon has a relatively educated youth population with one fifth of Lebanese men and 40% of Lebanese women having a university degree\(^4\). The Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) regulates the education sector in Lebanon. Education consists of two sectors: private and public schools and universities, the latter are almost free of charge. Formal education in Lebanon has two main streams: general education and technical and vocational education.

1) General education is structured in three phases:
   - Pre-school education (ages 3-5)
   - Basic education (ages 6-14), further divided into:
     - Cycle One: Grades 1 to 3
     - Cycle Two: Grades 4 to 6
     - Cycle Three: Grades 7 to 9
   - Secondary education (ages 15-18)

2) The Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET), as a parallel option, mainly after Cycle Three\(^5\)

After secondary education, every student abiding by the Lebanese system will obtain a General Baccalaureate (academic) or a Technical Baccalaureate after the official examinations. Both diplomas (Academic or Technical) allow access to tertiary education. Tertiary education in Lebanon includes technical and vocational institutes in addition to colleges and universities.

---

Regarding public education enrollment and success rate:

- 29.2% of Lebanese students enroll in public education
- In public schools, the 9th grade success rate is 55% compared to 74% in private schools
- National repetition rate is 18.2% in public schools

Pre-crisis, the Lebanese Public education system accommodated less than a third of Lebanese students.\(^6\)

Currently, the Lebanese public education system has been in slow decline due to insufficient investment in infrastructure and premises, employment of unskilled teachers for low wages, outdated teaching methods (teacher-centered), unfavorable public resource allocation, as well as limited discourse towards investment in primary and post primary education.\(^7\) According to the ILO, some of Lebanon’s educational skills and labor force problems are mainly due to inequality in school access, mismatch of skills to those required in the job market, immigration of educated youth “the brain drain,” mismatch of wage expectation vs low market rates, and discouraged youth. In 2013, the inactivity rates of Lebanese youth reached 70%.\(^8\)

The influx of Syrian refugees affects public education in Lebanon and increases the number of challenges such as lowering enrollment rates for Lebanese and increasing costs. For example, the Ministry of Education and Higher Education said, “enrolment of Lebanese children in public schools declined from 249,000 in (2011) to 238,000 in (2014)”.\(^9\) In the academic year 2013/2014, the cost of education for 90,000 Syrian children in Lebanese public schools was approximately 183 million and by 2014/15 the cost reached 348-434 million.\(^10\)

---


\(^8\) International Labour Organization, Towards Decent Work in Lebanon: Issues and Challenges in Light of the Syrian Refugee Crisis, 2015


TVET Education in Lebanon

The number of students enrolled in VTE institutions (formal education) in 2008-2009 was at 87,961 representing a 107% increase from 1996-1997 at 40,039 enrollees. This increase in enrolled students is due to an increase in VTE establishments totaling around 447 establishments in 2008-2009.11

### Total new entrants to the labour market from universities and VTE establishments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>New entrants to the labour market</th>
<th>2008-2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University students and graduates</td>
<td>19,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTE students and graduates</td>
<td>24,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baccalaureate degree holders and dropouts from intermediate and secondary education who enter the labour market</td>
<td>17,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>61,200</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This table is sourced from ILO and the Consultation and Research Institute, Review and Assessment of Labor Market Information, September 2014 P 40

### Administrative Structure of Vocational and Technical Education in Lebanon

The vocational and technical education sector is under the Directorate General of VTE (DGVTE) and inside the Ministry of Education and Higher Education.

Below, is a breakdown of the TVET administrative structure translated from a document set by M. Nabil Abi Atallah and M. Issam Abi Nader, (The administrative structure of vocational and technical education in Lebanon that leads to quality in education, 2007).
Decree No. 8349 dated 2/5/96 determined the administrative staff of the Directorate General of Vocational and Technical Education as follows:

This chart is adapted from N. Abi Atallah and E. Abi Nader, the administrative structure of vocational and technical education in Lebanon that leads to quality in education, 2007
Directorate General for Vocational and Technical Education includes:
1. Administration and Implementation Service
2. Technical Service
3. Accounting and Auditing Service
4. Vocational Rehabilitation Service
5. Monitoring and Examinations Service
6. Informatics and Statistics Service
7. Educational Units in the Governorates

The DGVTE has links to institutes, schools, and official training centers.

1. Administration and Implementation Service:
   1.1 The Administrative Unit shall execute
   - Administrative work
   - Editorial and translation affairs
   - Prepare the necessary draft resolutions, notes, and circulars
   - Record complaint records and forward them to valid references
   - Archives

   1.2 The Legal Unit shall
   - Prepare draft laws, decrees, and agreements and verify their legality in cooperation with various units of the ministry
   - Prepare acquisition transaction paperwork
   - Formulate student insurances for accidents
   - Draft internal regulations for educational institutions and centers of formal vocational rehabilitation projects
   - Formulate opinions on disputes arising between the administration and others
   - Investigate complaints and prepare responses
   - Offer legal advice
   - Coordinate between administrative and judicial oversight bodies and the ministry

   1.3 The Personnel Unit shall execute
   - Prepare individual-transactions belonging to all employees of the Directorate
   - Organize and archive original documents belonging to personnel files
   - Include these documents successively in files according to the changing situations of their owners
   - Pursue the cases of the Directorate employees and users of the State Employees Cooperative

   1.4 Supplies Unit shall
   - Prepare supplies transactions
   - Manage the central warehouse and the warehouses of institutes and schools
   - Receive material and equipment
   - Provide security and cleaning services

   1.5 Public Relations and Publications Unit
   - Manage information and advertising interactions
   - Organize Ministry's communications and public relations activities
Study how to establish cooperative relations with institutions, associations, organizations, and media
- Information Affairs
- Compile media clippings regarding the activities of the Directorate
- Manage magazine and newspaper subscriptions
- Issue periodic publications on learning and training
- Learn about the interests of graduate students
- Direct the media of private technical institutes and schools
- Organize lectures and seminars aimed at guiding and directing students and the general public to various fields and disciplines of vocational education and training

2. Technical Service:
   2.1 Studies and Research and Development Service Unit
   - Carry out studies that define the objectives, competencies, and classifications of vocational and technical education in different stages
   - Explore the technical needs of the country in both numerical and qualitative terms of education and training and propose projects to meet these needs
   - Identify needs of the public and private sector for teachers and trainers in different specialties in technical institutes and in vocational training centers in line with the development plans of various Lebanese regions and meet the needs of the labor market
   - Propose the establishment of institutes, technical schools, and official training centers in different governorates
   - Evaluate the effectiveness of educational processes in the vocational and technical sector
   - Study hourly teaching contracts from a technical perspective
   - Outline the functions of educational owners each year in the budget and identify the competencies required

2.2 The Technical Cooperation Unit shall, in Cooperation with Specialized Administration, in Particular the Ministry of Foreign Affairs
   - Secure links between the Directorate and the various official administrations and private institutions related to vocational and technical education at home and abroad
   - Enhance channels of communication with business and production sectors
   - Manage technical cooperation agreements
   - Exchange missions and technical trips between Lebanon and abroad
   - Organize conference and seminar affairs
   - Manage grants and assistance to teachers and students
   - Manage relations with the United Nations and international, regional, and local organizations concerned with vocational and technical education
   - Prepare conferences, symposia, and seminars in Lebanon and provide the facilities required for the participants and ensure their residence and transportation

2.3 Equipment and Maintenance Unit Shall
   - Prepare studies to determine the specifications of furniture as well as administrative and technical equipment
   - Develop technical studies regarding buildings and structures
   - Manage the conditions of books
   - Prepare new project implementation programs
   - Field detection of private institutions buildings and ensure that technical specifications are available before licensing these institutions
- Monitor investment activities in institutes, schools, and training centers in both technical and economic terms
- Ensure maintenance of technical equipment
- Study the state of buildings belonging to the Directorate to work on maintenance

2.4 Curriculum and Educational Technique Unit
- Suggest the formation of committees and task forces to prepare educational curricula
- Set educational curricula, follow-up evaluations, and develop studies that can modify curriculum according to educational, scientific, professional, and industrial development
- Propose curricula projects to teach new specializations
- Coordinate investment activities in different institutes to conform them with the educational curricula
- Publish books, teaching aids, teaching methods
- Develop tests and questions covering all disciplines in vocational and technical education and offer them to the official examination committees

3. Accounting and Auditing Service:

3.1 Accounting Unit
- Draft the budget of the administration.
- Organize applications for credit reserve
- Manage salary scales, wages, bonuses, financial assistance, and secure timely payments
- Filter operations
- Study applications for opening credits

3.2 Audit Department
- Supervise the financial accounts of institutes, schools, and training centers
- Monitor accounting materials in institutes, schools, and official training centers
- Offer opinions on budgets of joint projects and audit their accounts

4. Vocational Rehabilitation Service:

4.1 The Vocational Training Programs Unit
- Develop vocational training programs and follow up on their implementation
- Coordinate investment activities in various vocational training centers and ensure that these activities are consistent with the curriculum.
- Publish books, teaching aids and means of clarification in the field of vocational training

4.2 Training Levels Unit
- Train and guide trainers, evaluate their performance, and ensure that the educational goals are analyzed in cooperation with competent authorities
- Study the requirements of the centers of training facilities
- Organize training center files
- Pre-investigate license to open centers
- Periodic reports on the trainers’ activities and on the outcomes of trainings
- Ensure liaison and cooperation with all institutions working on TVET locally and abroad
- Enhance channels of communication with business and production sectors
- Conduct professional analysis and define professional and performance standards
- Design professional tests and supervise their implementation
- Evaluate external deformity of training programs
- Follow-up with graduates and studies
5. The Service of Monitoring and Examinations

5.1 The examination Unit shall
- Organize administrative transactions related to official certification examinations and propose appropriate measures for their implementation
- Prepare official certificates and official statements and deliver to stakeholders
- Receive applications for official examinations and organize candidates' cards
- Monitor annual exams
- Organize exams to enter public schools and institutes

5.2 Educational Monitoring Unit: the division of Public Education and the Division of Private Education. The public Education Division shall:
- Supervise the regularity of education in centers and schools and monitor the implementation of curricula
- Prepare annual reports and whenever necessary report on the activities of the staff and their needs for preparation and training
- Evaluate the performance of the educational body and ensure the achievement of educational goals in cooperation with competent authorities
- Organize work schedules
- This division undertakes the tasks assigned to it in full cooperation with the administrations of the public schools and institutes

The Private Education Department shall
- Study the applications for licensing the opening of private technical schools
- Organize and archive the files of private technical institutes and schools
- Supervise the educational system in private technical institutes and schools and monitor the implementation of curricula
- Evaluate the performance of the educational body and ensure the achievement of educational goals in cooperation with competent authorities
- Secure a working relationship with private educational institutions
- Authenticate statements issued by private institutions according to standardized models
- Adjust school data and records of faculty members and track conditions of students

5.3 The Secretariat of the Equivalence Committee: The Secretariat of Equivalence has a special decree that governs its composition, functions, working methods, and all matters relating to its activities.

6. Service of Informatics and Statistics: Directly reports to the General Director for Vocational and Technical Education and shall
- Prepare, design, and implement information systems to automate all departments and activities of the Directorate
- Establish an information communications network between the various departments of the Directorate and the official educational institutions
- Manage the Central Informatics Center in the Directorate
- Issue periodic statistical data on vocational and technical education
- Collect data for the various departments of the Directorate
7. **Educational Unit in the Governorates**

The Educational Units represent the antennas of the DGVTE in the governorates, they are responsible of assuring the link between the institutes and schools and the DGVTE in terms of communication and administrative procedures.

8. **Technical Institutes and Schools**

All technical and vocational schools are under the authority of the General Director including public and private schools and for all levels and types of schools and institutions.

**TVET Education Structure in Lebanon**

Technical and Vocational Education and Training have two structures based on the decree n. 8590, August 2012,\(^{12}\):

**Vocational Training:** “Concerns manual trades and those whose technological development doesn’t involve very extensive general knowledge.” (ETF, 1999)

The vocational field includes professions and trades that require only exclusive information and are purely manual. The skills are practical and manual skills and less theoretical.

The vocational training field comprises four levels, three of which lead to an award of completion:

1. Short-term training: This complementary level leads to the vocational intermediate level BP (Brevet Professionnel) and takes two years\(^{13}\) to complete.
2. BP (Brevet Professionnel): The executive level leads to the vocational secondary certificate LP (DS - Dual System) and takes three years to complete.
3. Baccalaureate Professional – Dual System: The middle level leads to a Meister’s degree. Studies at this level take two years.

**Technical Education:** “Concerns trades whose mastery requires high-level scientific and technological skills, thereby requiring more extensive general education”. (ETF, 1999)

Technical education also requires a thorough grounding in general education. This field comprises three levels:

1. BT (Baccalauréat Technique): The Executive Level leads to the Technical Baccalaureate Certificate (BT) and takes three years.
2. TS (Technicien Supérieur): The Middle Level: The Superior Technician Certificate (TS) takes two years to complete.
3. The Higher Technical Level is divided into two paths:
4. The Technical Bachelor Certificate (LT): Students holding a (TS) certificate can join this level to earn a Technical Bachelor Certificate (LT). It takes one year to complete this level.
5. The Technical Educational Bachelor Certificate: Students holding a General Secondary Certificate or a BT are able to join this level to earn a Technical Educational Bachelor Certificate (LET). It takes four years to obtain a certificate that aims to prepare technical education teachers.\(^{14}\)

---

\(^{12}\) European Training Foundation-ETF/ Overview of Technical and Vocation education in Lebanon

\(^{13}\) According to the decree 10391, June, 4, 2013

In 2012, the Lebanese government reviewed the existing TVET structure (i.e. fields, levels and certificates) and issued new legislations. Currently, a new framework establishes four main areas:

1. Reviewing and upgrading the curricula and fields of specializations;
2. Reviewing and upgrading the academic structure of the TVET system;
3. Developing qualified human resources and upgrading funds and infrastructure;
4. Strengthening the sector’s ties to local and private partners.

However, the framework lacks a roadmap that clearly defines roles and responsibilities, details on the bodies in charge of implementation, and execution of programs. This resulted in a partial implementation.

**Background and Purpose of Report**

This report is based within the framework of the YEM project which seeks to enhance youth employment and entrepreneurship through improved skills anticipation systems, promote relevant and quality technical and vocational education and training (TVET), and knowledge sharing across the region. This report seeks to propose a methodology to comprehensively analyze the Lebanese situation on labor market analysis including constitutive elements of a standard and an advanced Labour Market Information System based on relevant international experiences, an evaluation of existing tools and methodologies, both quantitative and qualitative used by stakeholders. The analysis will look at anticipation and identification of skills needed such as sectoral skills development strategies, occupation standards and qualifications, and curricula design and revision. The report will review existing tools to monitor the external efficiency of skills development programs. In particular, the tools used to assess the transition from education and training programmes to the labour market, which include graduate tracer studies, labour market insertion studies, and stakeholders involvement in designing and using these tools. A UNESCO consultant wrote the report on LMIS in Lebanon and the findings will be implemented between April and June 2018.

A desk review of publications and a list of interviews conducted with local and international NGOs, governmental bodies, educational bodies help inform this report. List of the interviewed in Annex (1).

---

LMIS Definitions

There are a number of descriptions for LMIS in the study. “The Labor Market Information System as an Instrument of Active Labor Market Policies” By Silke Woltermann for (GIZ) in 2012, the LMIS was introduced as: “an active labor market policy instrument that collects evaluates and provides labor market information to both the labor supply side and the labor demand side”. According to an ILO study by Ivan Martin, LMIS are “the set of institutional arrangements, procedures and mechanisms by which a country can assure that all relevant labour market information is collected, shared, and channeled to relevant institutions to be analyzed and processed into labour market matching and policy planning processes. An LMIS is primarily a “system” that is a group or combination of dynamically interrelated, interdependent, and interacting elements forming a structure with a common purpose. As far as the elements of this system are concerned, they are institutions, private sector, and civil society actors. They linked through information flows and coordination mechanisms”. According to the EU commission (Skills panorama) 2015, LMIS are “systems, mechanisms or processes for gathering, organizing, providing, and analyzing information about the state of the labor market, occupation and job, including key changes taking place within employment, jobs, and occupation.”

LMIS Functions

The basic functions of a LMIS are mainly:

1. **Job placement and matching**: provide data on vacancies to individuals and give individuals’ information (i.e. their skills) to employers.
2. **General information on market needs** such as jobs, tasks, and skills for specific occupations, as well as professions available for different types of education, wages, growing areas of the economy, and new occupations.
3. **Information on Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET)** such as information on schools for technical and vocational education and trainings, public courses, information on qualification programs for individuals looking for new types of jobs, or skill development that helps job seekers improve their chances to return to the labor market.
4. **Job profile development**, search and application skills. Job profile development helps determine individual skills, interests, and information about different professions especially for students deciding on a career, job seekers who have worked in now-redundant jobs, individuals looking for new professions, as well as refugees and migrants.
5. **Search and application skills** to help job seekers search and apply for jobs.
6. **Information for employers** to scan profiles of skilled individuals.
7. **Information about the development of different sectors and professions** and about institutions offering technical and vocational education and training and qualification courses.
8. Information for governments such as identifying target groups who experience difficulties entering the labor market, sectors lacking skilled workers, problematic effects of certain labor legislations and labor market policies, and information about general development of employment indicators. (Saudi Arabia followed this method because its labor force was inclined towards choosing public jobs but when the government could not employ more individuals, it changed its policies to promote jobs in the private sector.) With dynamic information from the market, experts helped Saudi Arabia revise its policies in terms of Human Resource Development and push for new jobs in the private sector.\textsuperscript{16}

**LMIS Elements**

**Elements of LMIS and their Corresponding Requirements:**

- **Institutions:** These actors include the private sector, public sector, trade unions, and experts from educational institutions, research centers, and civil society. The integration and cooperation of these actors helps determine the effectiveness of LMIS. "Among them, the LMIS should identify producers and users of each component of labor market information and their respective information needs. Their involvement is a requisite for the success of any LMIS"\textsuperscript{17} (Martin, I 2011)

**LMIS Actors in Lebanon According to the ILO:**

- **Finance & Policy Information**
  - Ministry of finance
  - Ministry of economy and trade
  - Ministry of social affairs
  - Central Bank

- **Business and Industry Information**
  - Ministry of industry
  - Chamber of commerce
  - Association of Lebanese Industrialists

- **Labor Information**
  - Ministry of labor
  - Labor unions
  - Professional and other labor associations
  - UNDP
  - ILO

- **Education and Training Information**
  - Ministry of education
  - Ministry of Higher education
  - Universities
  - Vocational Training Institutes
  - Educational Center for Research and Development
  - NGOs skill training and employment services

- **Employment Services and Information**
  - NEO
  - Ministry of economy and trade
  - Ministry of social affairs
  - Central Bank

- **Labor market trends and forecasting information**
  - CAS
  - Ministry of labor
  - Ministry of social affairs
  - Other labor market research organizations (Ex: CRI)

- **Population Information**
  - CAS
  - Ministry of social affairs

---

\textsuperscript{16} R. Hokayem, Personal Discussion, June 4, 2018

\textsuperscript{17} Iván Martín, (ILO), Best Practice on Collecting and sharing migration data for the improvement of the labor market information system, 2011 (P 21)
1. **Information (Data):** Both vertical and horizontal data gathered on a regular basis and integrated within the system for relevant outputs, foresights, and studies. In an interview conducted with Ms. Rania Hokayem, (Program Officer, ILO) she stressed that information collected should be from both the supply and demand side. Information from the supply side is mostly administrative and comes from ministries. This information includes the number of graduates from formal education, (Universities and TVET) or from accelerated programs. Academic in brevet, baccalaureate 1 and 2, graduate and post graduate levels or TVET (BT, PB, TS, LT..), migration from one program to another, drop out levels, etc.. All these changes from the supply side should be observed, and data should be collected on the number of graduates in each specialization and the number of competencies in each curriculum and program. In the demand side, the market should monitor economic sectors specifically how they develop, if they create job opportunities, and if there is enough investment in these sectors to create new job opportunities and sustain existing jobs. Another factor to observe is if companies have skills development trainings or work based learning (WBL) programmes for their work force. It is also important to observe the current labor force as well as its composition and development; and keep track of changes in the unemployment levels, and which age groups and educational levels are more affected. Data gathering will allow us to compare the current work force verses the future work force.

2. **Technical Base (System):** “Data sharing mechanisms should have a technological base (a platform for information sharing and exchange); rules for this information sharing or exchange (regularity, limitations, use, etc. and a joint understanding of concepts and definitions making shared or exchanged information compatible.” (Martin, I 2011) ¹⁸

3. **Analysis:** “This analysis requires specialized interdisciplinary skills and close interactions with users of information (in particular policymakers) to ensure relevance.” (Martin, I 2011)¹⁹

According to Ms. Hokayem, “the bulk of the work relies on the analysis of the data. Thus, looking at the cadre of who can do the analysis, we need to search for the ministry that can undertake such analysis.” For example, in Tunisia, they created the labor market observatory whose role was to gather data and analyze it for all institutions, but their main reference was the Ministry of Labor and Work Force. The Tunisian National employment office deals with employment programs, the Ministry of Labor looks at work policies and laws, and the Vocational Educational Institutes Ministry does not create new programs without coordinating with the related ministries. This type of coordination between ministries with the purpose of integrating services does not exist in Lebanon.

4. **Information Dissemination:** Disseminating information on a regular basis in the form of monthly or quarterly bulletins with statistics, trend analysis, and yearbooks with a comprehensive overview of socio-economic issues. Rania Hokayem says, such a system can provide important information and give an overview of the labor market in terms of human resources (salary scale, education levels for jobs, and job descriptions); this is only part of the information that needs to be on the system for business or students. Students want to know what specialization to choose, what educational level to opt for, what jobs they can get with their post graduate degree, salary scale, and average salary.”²⁰

---

¹⁸ Iván Martín, (ILO), Best Practice on Collecting and sharing migration data for the improvement of the labor market information system, 2011 (P 21)
¹⁹ Iván Martín, (ILO), Best Practice on Collecting and sharing migration data for the improvement of the labor market information system, 2011 (P 21)
²⁰ R. Hokayem, Personal Discussion, June 4, 2018
Labor Market Information Generation and Flow of Labor Market Information

The figure above was adapted from the study: “Current Practices in Labour Market Information Systems Development For Human Resources Development Planning in Developed, Developing and Transition Economies”, (ILO), by Nicholas Manghozo, P 11
**LMIS Effects on Unemployment:**
The LMIS affects productivity of the labor supply side by providing information needed about changes in skill requirements in specific sectors and may provide career counseling that leads to better occupation choices.

LMIS also affects labor market flexibility by having a positive impact on the information flow within the labor market by collecting, evaluating, and providing information to all parties in the labor market.

Labor market flexibility and productivity are the main factors of influence on employment and growth as shown in figure 2.

**Figure 2: Factors Affecting the Rate and the Growth of Employment**

LMIS in Lebanon: Overview

Lebanon suffers from a gap between labor force demanded and labor force supplied. In addition, there are 1700 classified jobs with no salary scales. Other problems include financial difficulties due to the Syrian crisis, inflation, high unemployment rates especially among university graduates, a non-unified description or classification of skills for jobs vs. curriculum, high influx of refugees, a strained economy, as well as local students’ preference for academic post-graduate degrees rather than vocational and technical education.

**Estimation of Labour Supply and Demand**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model: Labour Market in Lebanon</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Supply</strong></td>
<td><strong>Demand</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University students and graduates</td>
<td>19,624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTE students and graduates-Formal</td>
<td>11,809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTE Graduates-informal</td>
<td>12,243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drop out</td>
<td>17,569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Yearly Supply</strong></td>
<td>61,245</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An LMIS can assist in solving many of the above-mentioned problems. Numerous NGOs and international organizations implement projects that attempt to resolve these challenges such as the International Labour Organization through their Public Employment Service project and the International Rescue Committee (IRC) through their livelihoods programs.

In 2009-2010, the ILO did an extensive study on LMIS by identifying related institutions and developing a system. The project plan included an assessment of the information available. As mentioned one of the central parts of an LMIS is accurate, timely, and reliable data. The ILO reviewed information in terms of systematic gathering, quality and accuracy of information available.

The ILO was able to achieve a consensus from all relevant institutions in pushing for an LMIS; however, relevant ministries did not adopt the plan effectively, which negatively affected the timeframe for the implementation. There was no final agreement on which institution would own the system; although, the ILO suggested the Ministry of Labor. The ILO also found gaps in the information assessments as certain information was inexistent and the information that was available was not accessible because other institutions owned it and needed governmental agreements to access it.  

21 R. Hokayem, Personal Discussion, June 4, 2018
Data sharing and coordination is a major challenge in Lebanon because there is no E-government nor centralized data pool. There is a lack in collaboration between ministries and entities producing and owning data.

Regarding NEO website, it is currently an electronic labor exchange through which one can do job matching, this feature can be a stand-alone system or integrated within an LMIS.\(^\text{22}\)

According to Ms. Hokayem, the NEO website now has a general description of the institution, services it provides, and departments available. The ILO also looked at a job matching system, which includes a business profile and a student/job seeker profile. The website is supposed to be information available regarding the labor market and tips for job searching, jobs available, news, as well as summaries of studies. These functions are especially important because NEO is not well known. The website is seen as a foundation for a future LMIS in case the ILO is able to formalize such a system in Lebanon.

Stated in an evaluation summary conducted by the ILO in 2011, about the “Support to Public Employment Services in Lebanon” project which seeks to ensure:

1. increased institutional capacity of the National Employment Office (NEO) of the Ministry of Labour (MOL) to assist the unemployed and underemployed and ensure efficient and equitable provision on employment services;
2. Improved connectivity of municipalities, employers, and job seekers to a general network of employment related information through the enhancement of the labour market information (LMIS) and the development of an occupational information system (OIS);
3. Enhanced self-employment opportunities through the establishment of successful small enterprises and improved skills. The evaluation stated that the project faced many difficulties beyond its control, which forced project management to steer the execution of its activities to be under project control.\(^\text{23}\)

As part of their bundled services approach, the IRCs livelihood centers in Lebanon offer bundled employment and self-employment services. In one center, Job seekers can access multiple services in the center such as job matching and referrals, business and life skills trainings, vocational training, legal counseling, and entrepreneurship support. Business owners and entrepreneurs can receive capacity-building support, mentorship opportunities, and grants for startups. In response to the Syrian crisis, the pilot project gave 24,000 people in Lebanon access to these services.\(^\text{24}\)

Currently, there is no LMIS in Lebanon, but there is a website hosted by the “the National Employment Office (NEO) which acts as an online labor exchange website through which one can do job matching and this website could be integrated within an LMIS,” Rania Hokayem, ILO. Similarly, there are other websites providing the same services, such as Daleel Madani, Bayt, Hire Lebanese, Mourjan, Hunting Lebanese, Jobs,.com by Lebanon Opportunities, OLX, ...etc.) as well as NGOs providing employment services. However, NEO is the only mandated institution with the responsibility of employment and data collection.

---

\(^\text{22}\) R. Hokayem, Personal Discussion, June 4, 2018
\(^\text{23}\) Evaluation summary conducted by the ILO in 2011, about the “Support to Public Employment Services in Lebanon”:
\(^\text{24}\) IRC website, https://www.rescue.org/resource/economic-recovery-and-development-international-rescue-committee-enterprise-development-and
Labor Market Information Generation and Flow of Labor Market Information in Lebanon:

The figure above was sourced from the study: “Current Practices in Labour Market Information Systems Development For Human Resources Development Planning in Developed, Developing and Transition Economies”, (ILO), by Nicholas Manghozo, P 11 but was amended according to study findings.

Compared to the original figure on page 15 for LMIS Information generation and flow of labor market information, Lebanon’s outputs lack data, analysis, and coordination between entities to ensure that the proper outputs have comprehensive and timely data. In addition to the lack of cooperation, the data is inaccurate and not produced in a timely and systematic fashion.
The Lebanese National Employment Office (NEO) established in 1977 is a public institution based on the decree-law 77/80, with administrative and financial autonomy. NEO is under the tutorship of the Ministry of Labor and has a board of directors with a tripartite structure. The objectives of NEO are the following:

- Conduct studies and research to formulate employment policies for Lebanon.
- Improve the employability and skill level of the newly entrant labor force through an accelerated vocational training.
- Find job opportunities for job seekers through the Employment Bureau to reduce unemployment rates.
- Build the skills-set of individuals with disabilities to increase their employability

**Timeline of NEO Development**

NEO started as an employment office with an internal software system. In 1998, NEO had a static website; however, in 2004 with the help of the Office of the Minister of State for Administrative Development Works (Omsar) and the Kuwaiti for Arab Economic Development, it launched a dynamic online presence. Between 2008 and 2012, the ILO launched the “Public Employment Service” (PES) project to assist the Lebanese Ministry of Labour (MoL) and the National Employment Office (NEO) in the field of employability development.

The PES project has five components that seek to increase:

1. “Employment services programs and interventions
2. Nation-wide LMIS that includes an electronic job matching system or Electronic Labor Exchange ELE
3. Computer-assisted occupational information system for employment counselors
4. Entrepreneurship training programs
5. Cadre of trainers for public employment services delivery system.”

After the launch of the website in 2004, NEO faced many challenges including the death of Prime Minister Rafik Al Hariri in February 2005. Other obstacles include the lack of cooperation between the Lebanese ministries, geopolitical factors stifling data sharing, and legal obstacles in retrieving data. The ILO was only able to do some website updates for NEO, but was unable to change the role and productivity of NEO.

**Current Status**

**System**

Today, NEO has an employment website, a Microsoft matching, data system, and three employment offices in Tripoli, Saida, and Beirut. The offices provide job counseling and are equipped with seven job counselors; two in Tripoli, two in Saida, and three in Beirut, all qualified with employment counselors’ certifications from Canada.

---

25 The Consultation And Research Institute, Review and Assessment of Labour Market Information, ILO, 2011
The system at NEO has the following functions:

- Job placement and matching via an online application
- General information on different professions statically displayed
- Information on vocational training statically displayed
- Job profile development, job searching, and application skills also statistically displayed
- Information to interview skilled individuals through phone, email, fax. Once NEO gets a job offer from an employer, they validate it and post it online, if the candidate is interested then the job posting removed from the page and an interview scheduled with the employer.
- Studies in pdf format.

**Data Gathering**

NEO is able to access information from individuals, studies, TVET institutions, online, and from the general labor market. They gather job vacancies from employers via emails, faxes, face-to-face interviews, and online applications. They also gather data from the supply side of the market usually from job fairs at universities and other educational institutions.

**Reaching Stakeholders**

- **Users: Unemployed, Students and Companies**: NEO reaches out to students via fairs at educational institutes and outreach companies at job fairs. Unemployed individuals access the website through dawlati.com (informs.gov.lb).
- **TVET Institutes**: Neo prefers to contact TVET institutes after amendments to the contract between the two parties are effective.
- **Demand Side of the Market, Growing Markets and New Jobs**: NEO does not have any current outreach system for the demand side of the market. It does not have data on emerging markets and new job opportunities.
- **Legal**: In Lebanon, the National Employment Office is the only organization, which is legally allowed to engage in employment services.
With over 51 universities in Lebanon and 36,000 university graduates yearly, the government needs to monitor these institutions, evaluate sectors that have high/low enrollment rates, and distribute information guiding students on recommended sectors for higher job opportunities based on LMS collected. Universities need to help guide students on which sectors to enter, especially because the highest unemployment rate in Lebanon is amongst university graduates. There is no career guidance that helps identify possible career paths, complementary jobs or market demands. Some large private universities have a career center and offer employment guidance for their alumni, but this system does not exist on a national scale. In Lebanon, there is an imbalance between services needed and labor available. This is a major challenge because there is a knowledge gap between different types of education specializations and labour market demands. These challenges can be resolved with LMI guidance and occupation information.

Rania Hokayem, says, “Lebanon has always provided supply for outside markets but not for inside the country because once we focus internally we will have to look at TVET and not university graduates. There should be a balance between the different educational levels and types, as well as an understanding of the available jobs in the market.”

The Education Management Information System (EMIS) was developed by the Ministry of Education and can be seen as a starting point to look at data relevant to the curriculum and ensure that the information is useful for analysis. However, the information about supply is inadequate and needs to be updated. This information needs to match the demand to have relevant data for curricula and skills needed. Consultant spoke to a member of the High Curriculum Committee for curricula revision and new curricula to identify current methodologies, gaps, and recommendations as shown below:

**Current Methodologies**

In an interview with a member of the High Curriculum Committee in the Directorate General for Vocational and Technical Education department, whose job is to review current curricula, decided on a new needed curricula in Lebanon. The following methodologies were identified:

1. Current curricula revision in which the High Curriculum Committee relies on a technical committee formed by representatives who work in different fields to keep track of skills needed in the labor force, give recommendations on the skill sets needed, and jobs in demand.

2. New curricula needed for the Lebanese labor force, the High Curriculum Committee takes decisions based on two methodologies:
   a. DACUM (Developing a Curriculum) “is a quick yet highly valid job analysis technique. The DACUM process is used to determine the competencies that should be addressed in a training curriculum for a specific occupation” 26 the process is a one or two-day storyboarding method that provides an overview of what a worker does in terms of duties, tasks, knowledge, skills, traits, and tools the worker uses. The

---

26 Ida M. Halasz, Ph.D., NIC Academy Division, Overview of DACUM Job Analysis Process, September 1994
information is part of an infographic and includes information on critical and frequently performed tasks and training needs of workers.  

b. Best international practices and desk reviews.

Obstacles in Current Methodologies

1- Current curricula revision, the two main obstacles are that there is not a full representation of the demand side of the market, rather a representation of certain company’s requirements through the available members of the technical committee. Secondly, when provided with input on the skill set needed within certain companies’ workflow, there is no supply side data to compare to, in order to decide whether the tasks required are already available in the market or should be part of TVET curriculums.

2- New curricula needed for the Lebanese labor force, the obstacles faced were as follows:
   a. A main prerequisite for conducting a DACUM, is a clear demand for jobs within specific regions. The data is currently nonexistent so the committee is taking inaccurate decisions. There is also a lack of data on task differentiation within each specialization required.
   b. Best international practices and desk reviews, these practices recommended are not always applicable in Lebanon in terms of employability.

Recommendations for Current Methodologies

1- Current Curricula Revision:
   a. For the lack of representation of the demand side, an extensive contact with all companies is needed which can be provided through a full LMIS.
   b. For the lack of supply side data to compare recommended tasks to existing tasks, also a full LMIS system is needed to review local skills in the market.

2- New Curricula Needed:
   a. As a prerequisite for DACUM, a market study on regional market demands should be available and reviewed yearly by the High Curriculum Committee
   b. To solve the lack of contact with representatives who can provide data on employability, a network that connects the General Directorate of TVET with governmental entities such as syndicates, ministries, Chamber of Industry and Commerce and Industrialists Association as well as an information database on the demand side of the market.

TVET and LMIS: Data Sharing and Collaboration

A High Curriculum Committee member expressed a potential collaboration between the General Directorate for TVET and a functioning national LMIS in terms of data exchange:

Data Gathering

The High Curriculum Committee member expressed the need of the General Directorate for TVET for:
   a. Regional market demand needs such as jobs posted or skill sets required.
   b. Regional labor force supply such as the unemployed in each region with their specific skill set.

27  DACUM, retrieved from URL http://www.dacum.org/
c. Regional educational institutes available such as public and private institutes (Accredited or not), companies, and NGOs providing trainings on short, medium, and long-term courses.

Data Sharing

The High Curriculum Committee member expressed the need for the General Directorate for TVET to share the following types of data with a national LMIS in order for the demand side of the market to make better employment choices:

- Number of annual graduates based on levels and specializations
- Competencies required for each curriculum

Recommendations on Setting Educational Strategies

Many factors are involved in setting education strategies, but information is a prerequisite for any step forward. “When setting an educational strategy, information about the demand and supply need to be compared. The information from the demand side needs to be assessed according to local and regional markets (LMIS has to look at the regional level).” - Rania Hokayem

Both education sectors and the labor market force need to exchange information directly. NEO can be the organization that supports data collection and information exchange because one of its mandates is to gather information about the labor market, analyze it and set policy recommendations.

The value and interests of each student are inherent to any job seeker; therefore, educational strategists cannot cancel majors because interest and passion of a student may lead to success and innovation even in a saturated market. Therefore, a prerequisite for educational guidance is also keeping track of students’ interests and inclinations.

In addition, when identifying the number of people required to filling the gap in demand of each job sector, alternatives for individuals who did not find employment in their field. For example, provide information about different positions with this specific degree if complemented with certain trainings/workshops or provide linkages and guidance to locations or countries with a demand for their specific job.

Currently, the government cannot provide this service, but associations can provide these services and therefore are supported.

When setting educational strategies, organizations must be aware of the needs of the labor market (skills, duties, educational levels of each job). This information from both sides (supply and demand) need to be available for analysis. Studies on sector trends and available jobs are also needed. For example, a study done by ILO on agricultural trends in Lebanon would come up with a list of jobs in demand. After which the list of jobs need to be analyzed in order to define what tasks, duties, overall objectives, and requirements, are required within a specific job. These classifications need to be determined as a primary tunnel to determine market demands than expand this knowledge to the source of supply: students, graduates, and education organization.
In a functional system, educational organizations will have access to occupational information and be able to compare it to the classifications. In a healthy economy with proper supervision, a persons’ position can be identified by its job requirements.

As for amending curricula, observing the list of jobs produced from sectoral studies and the description tasks and duties, they can be compared to the curriculum. The curricula can then be amended accordingly, once they are validated for relevance to the market.

In order to find and collect this information, there has to be a system in place to connect this information, as well as human resources to run such a system. Ministries should be connected to each other and have the proper tools (Automation/E-government) to share their data. This data needs to be collected and analyzed within a system (LMIS). However, NEO is the only organization with a mandate to engage in such activities under the Ministry of Labor. An LMIS should be created and strengthened for NEO, along with a solution to the challenges in obtaining information on Lebanon.

DACUM outcomes reflects directly into the career guidance section of LMIS and can assist greatly with information about what tasks one can expect to conduct in each job. DACUM is also related to the TVET section of the LMIS, in which TVET providers can study the tasks of each job and amend curricula accordingly.
UNRWA’s Placement and Career Guidance System (PCGS)

UNRWA’s PCGS was set in place in 2010 and updated in 2015. The PCGS helps track all graduates (both university and TVET level) from UNRWA across all of its fields and countries in order to get indicators about skills needed and courses demanded through tracking students’ interests, analyzing unemployment data, and extracting reports from the system.

Development of the Timeline
In 2017, PCGS added the Education Management Information System to meet the needs of educational program to follow up on their students, links students, monitor dropouts, refer students to psychosocial support, career guidance, and TVET support and input. Both UNRWA-funded systems complement each other and play an important role in a student’s life. However, this report will focus on PCGS.

Status PCGS

The PCGS is an internal job centered and information-based system with an attaché of job counseling. In Lebanon, PCGS has offices in Saida, Tyr, the North and Beirut. Employment offices provide the following services: weekly outreach to employers through outreach officers, job matching, follow-up with the job sector and employed, job counseling, job coaching, and advocacy like the “Right to Work Campaign.” Each office has a supervisor, an outreach officer, a job counselor, and a registration clerk. The supervisor has connections with the private sector and works on job advocacy for youth, while the outreach officer is knowledgeable of the job market and can give an overview to the job seeker. The outreach officer also follows up with unemployed individuals and refers them to the employment office where job counselors who are qualified in job coaching techniques, provide them with job coaching sessions to improve their presentation and communication skills. After 6 months of graduation, the PCGS follows up with the graduate and then again after one year after graduation.

The PCGS system has the following functions:

- Job placement and matching
- Job profile development and search and application skills
- Information to governments.

Since it is not an online system, employers cannot post vacancies on a platform nor can students directly search for jobs. Although the PSCGS team does not disseminate information about different professions, they do compile data from outreach officers about special skills needed and provide it to TVET institutions.

Evaluation

Follow-up visits and regular calls with employers help evaluate job placement, job profile development, and search and application skills.

28 The right to work campaign objective is “Enabling Palestinian refugees in Lebanon of practicing their right to work and to be treated equally with Lebanese”
PCGS also maps TVET institutes to make holistic evaluations. The mapping looks at the quality of TVET institutes such as workspace, space, environment, curriculum etc. Employment centers receive the mapping to assist students.

**Gaps and Recommendations in the PCGS**
Although there is lack in comprehensive labor data in Lebanon; in general, UNRWA through PCGS electronic systems combined with the efforts of the employment and career guidance unit is a great example of how a system can be complemented with human intervention overcoming certain obstacles.

Experts working on the system have expressed interest in taking the system online and making the applications E-copies and believe these efforts are doable with the appropriate funding.

**Data Gathering**
PCGS collects information for the demand side of the market such as growing market sectors, new jobs, as well as job vacancies, from the outreach officers who do field visits weekly, syndicates, and reports from the system itself. As for the supply side of the market, they refer to EMIS and job seekers for such data.

N.B: All the above information sources share their findings and distribute them across all departments in a collaborative approach to facilitate each other’s work. For example, if the Legal department or outreach officers get updates on the labor market, they share their finding throughout all departments. One of the problems of data gathering through PCGS is the frequency of contact information (for example, phone number) change of the unemployed, job seeker or graduate thus making them sometimes difficult to trace. An online system can solve such issues and facilitate communication between the job seeker and the agency.

**Reaching Stakeholders**

*Users: Unemployed, Students and Companies:*
The placement and career guidance unit reaches students through school visits, the unemployed through registration session, the employment office and announcements on social media. For companies weekly field visits, round table discussions, events, exhibitions, forums and job fairs ensure their involvement in the process.

All stakeholders are reached specifically in poor pockets (gatherings) with the collaboration of a local, regional NGO to call for registration sessions within the area for residents so they can be referred according to skill and needs.

*TVET Institutes*
PCGS is in close contact with TVET providers. PCGS provides information to TVET institutes on new skills needed from the demand side of the market and TVET institutes provide PCGS with data in order to ensure alignment in the curriculum and priorities of both parties.

*Demand Side of the Market*
PCGS is already in contact with companies, institutions, and governmental bodies with representatives from different UNRWA departments visiting corresponding sectors, industries, and institutes. PCGS contacts employers on a weekly basis and job vacancies are compiled through internal parameters. This methodology can be enhanced by taking the system online.
Growing Markets and New Jobs
For growing markets and new jobs, UNRWA gathers data from Lebanese syndicates and employment centers, this data is usually updated upon the release of new information. These stakeholders are encouraged to engage through materials produced such as flyers, through social media and are encouraged to visit the employment centers at least once all of which being part of a communication plan.

Skill Matching
The software matches across all standard fields and then a job counselor validates the match.

Jobs, Industries Sectors Recommended
As an NGO working for Palestinians, in Lebanon the jobs recommended for students are usually freelance jobs such as graphic design and within the legally allowed jobs for Palestinians to practice in Lebanon.

LABORA

Labora was established in 2008 and is funded by Lebanese business owners to minimize Lebanese immigration and emigration and help Lebanese find jobs, especially the Christian community. These objectives are selected due to studies done by the Labora team that showed an unemployment rate of 22% in Lebanon (2008) and especially in Mount Lebanon with unemployment rates at 29% (2008).

Development of Time-line
In 2008, Labora formed a committee of 12 specialized people in respective fields (H/R, Statistics etc. ...) which started preparations for the project that lasted approximately 18 months. Regarding implementation, Labora started with word-of-mouth and outreach via religious centers and church congregations then a system was set up and they had online presence, where meetings were conducted once a week for orientation and employment. In the implementation phase some obstacles were faced such as the lack of commitment from job seekers, ‘nepotism/boosting’ in employment and the lack of harmony between the labor market and university graduates. Delay in the implementation phase was due to the long time governmental procedures take.

Current Status Labora
LABORA has a job based internal system, an online application and individual job counseling service (SRM System). Laboras’ main office is in Antelias and has one office in Labaa, Zahle and in Batroun that provide orientation, training, outreach, employment and follow up. Total staff amount to fifteen people, three in the orientation team, four in training, four in the private sector and four in management. In each office, there is one full time employee who also carries out Laboras’ activities.

The Labora system has the following functions:
- Job placement and matching
- General information about different professions
- Information on Technical and vocational education and training
- Job profile development and search and application skills
- Information for governments
- Studies.
Evaluation
Job placement and matching, general information about different professions are evaluated via yearly studies, whereas information on vocational education and training are twofold. Labora checks the needs of the labor market and send their results to TVET institutions and request modifications in specializations in return TVET institutes sends graduates to Labora. The SRM system matches the parameters between the job requirements and job seeker profile, Labora then validates job seeker and request them to fill out an application and sign an agreement. Regarding the information for governments, Labora requests the support of NEO.

Gaps and Recommendations for Labora
The gaps mentioned by the interviewed in the current Labora system was mainly the mentalities of the Lebanese people. Suggestions by the interviewed about improving the mentality of the Lebanese people to have the will to work in Lebanon were through awareness campaigns in the media and social media; in addition to governmental educational programs including an orientation about new jobs and new skills required in the market.

Data Gathering
Labora gets their information about the general labor market, the demand side of the labor market, growing markets and new jobs, job vacancies and the supply side of the market from the World Bank, NEO, private statistics companies, internal system analysis, governmental institutions, and statistical institutions. The biggest problems faced in data gathering is the lack of implementation of the Access to information’ law which was passed by the Lebanese Parliament on January 19, 2017 as well as the lack of credible numbers and figures in the Lebanese government. The ‘right to information’ law needs is essential whereas the studies in the government need to be implemented by specialists to have better data and transparency.

Reaching Stakeholders
- Users: Unemployed, Students and Companies: Labora has representatives in schools, TVET institutions, and universities to reach students and unemployed individuals. Labora has a database of around 1500 companies. In general, the interviewees felt that in order to have proper outreach, there should be an employment office in each city and that there should be applications and data that are accessible to all. Labora has collaborations with other employment websites in which they exchange job vacancies.
- TVET Institutes: Labora already has contact through their representative with some TVET institutions and sends new jobs to some institutes but the effect of suggested skills on TVET curriculum is slow and is currently working on having a bigger and stronger level of collaboration with TVET institutes.
- Demand Side of the Market: Labora has a database of companies that send them job vacancies that are matched in the system and validated by Labora. Labora expressed a potential of a 40% enhancement in their system specifically their need for more interview capacity within their offices from one side, and specialists to manage the orientation and validation of job seekers on the other, all of which requires additional budget.
- Growing Markets and New Jobs: The source of data for Labora in growing markets and new jobs comes directly from the private sector without a fixed period of update and analysis. Labora recommends the following jobs for future students: health care (nursing), petrol, petrochemical, carpenters, electricians, ironsmith, information technicians, accountants, secretaries, and assistants.

Prior to the crisis, Labora used to employ around 500 persons per year, after the Syrian displacement Labora currently employs around 180 individuals per year. The head of the Lebanese labor union also expressed the same decrease in number of employers asking for workers versus the daily calls they used to get requesting demand for workers prior to the Syrian displacement.
Labor Market Studies in Lebanon

Market Study Impacts and Methodologies

While interviewing international NGOs and looking at market studies at national, sectoral, and regional levels, results revealed that market studies have direct impacts when creating a foresight on TVET curriculums, as well as insights into the new skills and technology; since these studies focus on context, qualifications, expertise, and needs of the market.

The values of these studies, if published and taken into consideration by the decision makers concerned include rectified action taken accordingly by the government and direct impact labor market, TVET institutes and universities. These studies can be assessed by looking at how unemployment rates affected, employment productivity within the context of the study, follow up with graduates, perceptions surveys with employers and validation of skills.

Identified Methodologies

Regarding qualitative data, the sources were mostly the private sector, private/public sector/NGOs/UN Agencies and TVET studies. Background research were tracer studies and other studies mostly conducted by NGOs.

Data is always difficult to have access to due to many factors such as lack of time and interest, lack of indicators in market studies and difficulty in getting access to quantitative data.

When asking a governmental body, they also expressed dissatisfaction at the lack of data and when the data does exist it usually is more theoretical than practical with major obstacles such as language barriers since most studies are done in English.

For quantitative data, the sources used were studies by NGOs, UN agencies, LAS, UNDP, UNRWA (perceptional studies - placement and career guidance).

Most Reliable Sources of Information

The most reliable sources of information mentioned were personal interviews, the private sector, International NGOs, African/Arab unions (Tunisian, Morocco) and European unions (French/Italian Trade unions).

Data and Information Requested to be Available

Complete, comprehensive, correct and recent data about the labor market as well as quantitative studies. The Lebanese Labor Unions also expressed interest in data about legislations and translations of existing market studies into Arabic.

Interest in LMIS

NGOs expressed interest in using LMIS and agreed that creating such a system is possible.

Those interviewed expressed both interest to use such a system for research, to help the government, build educational programs, and contribute data to such a system.
The Criteria Recommended
The criteria and kind of data they would like to see on such a system:

1. Unified data tailored to each sector and sub sector regarding data gathering tools
2. Updated real time data about market and sectors, population and refugees.
3. Analysis of studies
4. Linked to Universities and schools
5. Market labor information
6. Skills required
7. List of saturated jobs and specializations
8. Revision of saturated jobs and specializations
9. Future of saturated jobs and specializations
10. Graduate follow up about their skills
11. System connection to supply and demand
12. Analyze CV, screening
13. Access to employers and job seekers
14. House hold information
15. Student analysis

Some requirements to create such a system as per the interviewed were:
- Access to a selection from the sub sectors of all size companies and interviews with small and medium sized companies is needed
- A will and commitment from policy makers, incentives from stakeholders, a well-equipped system, and capacity building Lebanon Labor Market Supply and Demand.

Gaps
In Lebanon, there is currently a gap between labor supply and demand. Gap areas come in the form of:

1. Mismatch between skills and competencies qualifications
2. Mismatch between position and profile of the candidate
3. TVET graduates do not match the labor market skills requirements
4. Lack updates in the TVET curriculum keeping up with new skills and jobs required
5. There is a large supply of labor due to Syrian displacement
6. Governments lack of interest in opening new fields
7. Lack of studies by the government to plan the management of the labor market
8. Lack of study about extinct occupations and about new professions (Agriculture, agro-food industry, oil, gas, etc.)
9. Business owners working for the government influence legislation

Recommendations
Recommendations to solve the gap between labor supply and demand:

1. Lack of governance has to be replaced with better governance
2. Lack of skills have to be improved via capacity building
3. Available information in the demand side of the market about graduates
4. Capacity building of NEO
5. Provide NEO with all market studies conducted
6. Neo to use these studies for analysis and publication (Meet with decision makers for these decisions to be taken into consideration)
7. Enhancing capabilities of NEO to become a full LMIS system
8. Authority of the educational curriculum
9. Planning by the Government to guide the labor market
10. Legislation and laws for employers and workers
Lebanese National Employment Office: Gaps and Recommendations:

NEO is a key player in the LMIS and their data is a base that can analyze market trend and offer guidance on employment trends. However, NEO should be more proactive with the market and collect more data. “In order to have a proper LMIS, it has to include everything such as career guidance, labor dynamics and the supply situation. For it to be successful there should be an entity to gather, analysis and summarize all this data and according to the recommendations, an intervention will take place. This LMIS should be owned and controlled by the Government.”- Rania Hokayem, ILO

The NEO’s administrative data is very important to both the job seeker who registers and the job vacancies collected. Their data also represents a base from which one can get indications about which sectors are employing; although this data needs to be backed up, it can provide some indication when taking into account frequency and number of jobs posted in certain sectors. (This might not be a sectoral indicator of growing jobs, as the turnover for these jobs is due to salaries or work conditions.)

Even with available information such as sectoral studies, it is not enough you will still need individuals to explain this data. For example as a business, this information might be beneficial to understand the direction of the market in terms of technologies and to understand the new policies regarding personnel affairs that might impact your business. All these require a team to sustain and maintain such a system and keep it up to date. 29

System Gaps and Recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GAPS</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>System does not track students, employers, unemployed</td>
<td>Mobile applications and SMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small number of staff</td>
<td>Add new staff with proper trainings and qualifications.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No nationwide coverage or reach</td>
<td>Marketing material</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reputation of being outdated</td>
<td>New system, larger servers, mobile app</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No feedback from employers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Software is old</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No new specializations or foresighted specializations listed</td>
<td>Add new foresighted jobs and skills required for the market place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online application process is complicated and too long</td>
<td>Update list of questions for job seekers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulty in dealing with TVET institutes</td>
<td>Update terms of the contract with TVET institutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of outreach to companies, students, and unemployed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The employment cycle involves too much human intervention</td>
<td>Update the system online so that NEO is informed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

29 R. Hokayem, Personal Discussion, June 4, 2018
Data Gaps and Recommendations

This information is not only beneficial to businesses and students but also policy makers who should rely on this information for national policies. NEO can use its’ own number of job seekers to come up with statistics. According to Mr. Salim Shehadeh from UNESCO, “we would like to see more comprehensive data and quantitative data in Lebanon”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GAPS</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of credible figures in the Lebanese Government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of online data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult questionnaires of NEO</td>
<td>Update online questionnaires</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non standardized levels</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of cooperation for data sharing</td>
<td>A governmental decree for ministries and institutes to share data with NEO yearly or quarterly...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of information from the demand side of the market</td>
<td>More involvement and coordination with educational institutes and the ministry of education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

National Gaps and Recommendations

“LMIS requires the whole government to be involved and not only one association or ministry.”- Rania Hokayem, ILO and as per Mr. Salim Shehadeh, “NEO needs the support of the Ministry of Labor “and Mr. Fadel from NEO suggested that for a collaboration to happen between the NEO and the private sector there needs to be a regulatory decree.30

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GAPS</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of coordination between ministries</td>
<td>Neo needs the support of the ministry of labor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentalities of students towards certain jobs/work in Lebanon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“The nepotism / boosting” in employment (Exchange of services)</td>
<td>Give employers incentives to work with NEO and employ Lebanese such as free social security for the employee for a year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers have their own employment system</td>
<td>Give employers incentives to work with NEO and employ Lebanese such as free social security for the employee for a year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

30 G. Fadel, Personal Discussion, April 23, 2018
Conclusion

After covering a spectrum of information regarding the current labor market, current employment systems, NGOs practices and different entities, four main focal points are identified as the problem with moving forward to build an LMIS system in Lebanon:

1. Data Collection
2. Technical System
3. Communication
4. Data Analysis and feedback

Work plan summary

1. Workshops and roundtables with representatives from different Ministries (Labor, education), CAS, NEO, training institutes and other organizations and syndicates. These events will ensure the buy-in of each entity so that they can develop a “LMIS unit” in each organization respectively to guide the organization on how to collect data and share it with all LMIS units.
2. A network for all “LMIS units” within each ministry, institution, and organization for quick and clear communications
3. NEO to reanimate its system to incorporate “LMIS units” data into the database and realign with ILOs recommendations and assistance
4. Create four main ‘think tanks’ for:
   a. Employment and HRD policies.
   b. Vocational Training and Guidance Policies Programs.
   c. Employment Service Operations.

Specialized organizations like the ILO should train and guide each “LMIS unit” so that all members can collect and communicate data to related think tanks and other LMIS units.

Each think tank will comprise of analysts and specialists in their field and will obtain data from the different respective LMIS units to analyze and prepare outputs accordingly.

LMIS and TVET

Within the Think tank for Vocational Training and Guidance Policies Programs, main mechanisms include:

- Matching of current supply with task force
- Forecasting future jobs and industries
- Create new specializations and curricula according to forecasting
- Reference for career guidance
- Send outputs and forecasts to the main database and to the Ministry of Education for
  - Technical Training of school career guidance counselors.
  - DACUM for curricula amendment and update
  - Develop new training programs and accelerated courses to adapt to market changes
With the buy-in of the ministries all final reports conducted by the ministries, think tanks are available to the “LMIS units” and career guidance counselors. As shown in the figure below:
One or Multiple LMIS

LABORA suggests one national LMIS system in Lebanon as Lebanon is a small country and there is no need for more than one LMIS. The NGOs’ suggest on building on what exists and building on the NEO system although NEO themselves, do not mind and even recommend more than one LMIS in Lebanon if each is specialized in their data/criteria and fields and a collaboration exists for data integration.

Annex 1. List of persons, institutions interviewed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rania Hokayem</td>
<td>ILO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairouz Houssein</td>
<td>UNRWA-Placement and Career Guidance Assistant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aurore Assaker</td>
<td>Consultant/Water and Agriculture expert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Castro Abdallah</td>
<td>Head of the labor union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tony Khadra</td>
<td>Labora-President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Fadel</td>
<td>National Employment Office- IT Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salim Shehadeh</td>
<td>UNESCO-TVET programme specialist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issam Abi Nader</td>
<td>High Curriculum Committee- Member</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Annex 2. Methodology

The consultancy team will work on qualitative approaches in order to reach the needed results. Thus the methodology will be divided accordingly:

- Qualitative
  - Desk Review:
    - What is LMIS and why is it needed.
    - LMIS components. (functions and requirements)
    - Background on local LMIS systems in Lebanon.
  - Interviews 1: Interviews with local NGOs/ governmental bodies using LMIS systems on criteria used, why it was chosen and current status.
  - Interviews 2: Questionnaires about market studies, data gathering methodologies and Lebanese LMIS will be prepared and conducted during one on one interviews with international NGOs and donors tackling tools used in previous market assessment:
    - UNESCO
    - UNHCR
    - ILO
    - WORLD BANK
    - UNICEF
    - UNRWA
    - ETF

N.B: note that the list of interviewees is a tentative one.

- Interview 3: Questionnaires about labor market gaps, information and local LMIS will be prepared and conducted during one on one interviews with governmental bodies:
  - Association of Lebanese Industries
- Chamber of Commerce and Industry and Agriculture
- Central Administration of Statistics
- Labour Union
- Center for Educational Research and Development

N.B: note that the list of interviewees is a tentative one.

- Analysis and Recommendations: The above used research methodology will be used to analyze the status of the current LMIS systems in Lebanon and recommendation for improvements.

Annex 3. List of References

1. DACUM, retrieved from URL http://www.dacum.org/
2. European Training Foundation - ETF/ Overview of Technical and Vocation Education in Lebanon
4. ILO, Evaluation summary, the “Support to Public Employment Services in Lebanon”, 2011
5. Ida M. Halasz, Ph.D., NIC Academy Division, Overview of DACUM Job Analysis Process, September 1994
6. ILO, LMI and Producers Handout
7. IRC website, retrieved from URL https://www.rescue.org/resource/economic-recovery-and-development-international-rescue-committee-enterprise-development-and
8. Martin I., Best Practice on Collecting and sharing migration data for the improvement of the labor market information system, ILO, (2011)
10. N. Abi Atallah and I. Abi Nader, The administrative structure of vocational and technical education in Lebanon that leads to quality in education], 2007 ()
13. The Consultation and Research Institute, Review and Assessment of Labour Market Information, ILO, (2011)